This Final Action Agenda/Minutes is supplemented by electronic recordings of the meeting, which may be reviewed upon request to the Village Clerk. Village Design Review Board meetings from June 30, 2016 forward can be viewed online at <u>http://estero-fl.gov/council/watch-meetings-online/</u>. Staff reports, resolutions, ordinances, and other documents related to this meeting are available at <u>https://estero-fl.gov/agendas/</u> at the corresponding agenda date.

APPROVED BY THE BOARD JUNE 16, 2017

FINAL ACTION AGENDA/MINUTES

Village of Estero 9401 Corkscrew Palms Circle Estero, FL 33928 Design Review Board February 8, 2017 5:30 p.m.

1. CALL TO ORDER: 5:30 p.m.

2. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE: Led by Chairman McHarris.

3. ROLL CALL:

Present: Chairman Joe McHarris and Board Members W. Scott Anderson, William Glass, Barry Jones, Anu Lacis, Albert O'Donnell, William Prysi and Patty Whitehead.

Also present: Village Land Use Counsel Nancy Stroud, Community Development Director Mary Gibbs and Development Review Manager Walter McCarthy.

4. APPROVAL OF AGENDA:

A motion to approve the agenda was made and duly passed.

5. BUSINESS:

(a) Consent Agenda

(1) Approval of Minutes: September 14, 2016, September 28, 2016 and October 26, 2016

A motion to approve the Consent agenda was made and duly passed.

(b) **Public Hearings**

Staff and audience members providing testimony were sworn in.

 McDonald's (LDO 2016-E016 Amendment #1) (District 7) 20310 Grande Oaks Shoppes Blvd, Shoppes at Grande Oaks, north of the northeast corner of Corkscrew Road and Ben Hill Griffin Parkway. Requesting upgrades to the approved Landscape Plan and addition of outdoor patio seating. Design Review Board approved the Landscape Plans on September 14, 2016 and staff approved the Landscape Plans on October 5, 2016.

No ex parte communications or conflicts of interest were noted.

Development Review Manager McCarthy provided a brief introduction.

Presentation/Information by:

Joshua Lockhart, PE and Maxwell Spann, RLA, CPH; Tim Fenton, McDonalds

Mr. Lockhart presented the enhanced landscaping: turf to landscape beds; palms added to south elevation for height variation; vegetation added to rear of store to help screen ladder; ground cover on east side; and patio seating on south elevation. The three patio tables are 36 inches in diameter for 12 seats total; no increased parking is necessary.

Mr. Spann explained that some plants that were not thriving in drainage areas will be replaced; variegated planting added along south; palms added near flag pole and existing patio; shrubs with mulch will minimize fertilization; confederate jasmine on lattice behind freezer/cooler; no planters on patio; beds along the driveway to be replanted.

Mr. Fenton addressed irrigation and the design of the patio seating.

Board Member Questions or Comments: Requests were made for fewer but larger confederate jasmine plants and for no color to draw eye to ladder; alternate plant options were discussed.

Public Comment: None.

Motion: Move to approve upgrades to the approved landscape plan and the addition of outdoor patio seating, with the conditions of fewer but larger jasmine plants and jatrophas replaced by 10-gallon podocarpus plants.

Motion by:	Board Member Prysi
Seconded by:	Board Member O'Donnell

Action: Approved upgrades to the approved landscape plan and the addition of outdoor patio seating, with the conditions of fewer but larger jasmine plants and jatrophas replaced by 10-gallon podocarpus plants.

Vote: Aye: Unanimous Nay: Abstentions:

(2) The Reef II (DOS2016-E012) (District 3)

The project is located in the northeast corner of the intersection of Estero Parkway and Three Oaks Parkway. 60-unit Multi-Family Student Housing development with associated parking and amenities. Requesting approval of the Development Order. At a Public Information Meeting held on October 26, 2016, the Design Review Board reviewed the Pattern Book and Monument Sign.

Chairman McHarris recused himself and stepped down from the dais in order to present the request; Board Member O'Donnell took over as Chairman. No ex parte communications or other conflicts of interest were noted.

Development Review Manager McCarthy provided a brief introduction.

Presentation/Information by:

Joe McHarris, McHarris Planning and Design Robert Knaak, Knaak Design Group

Mr. McHarris briefly described the project and presented the Master Concept Plan: Phase II is linked to Phase I via both vehicular and pedestrian connections; Phase II will utilize three different designs, one of which is from Phase I; color and texture provided by enhanced architectural details, some following the character of Phase I; a second pool and other amenities added; the enhanced roadway buffer with a berm has a fence between the landscaping along the roadways and the residential area; trees and the double-row hedge are increased in size; bicycle/pedestrian exits added to street. The owners are looking for more parking and options can be considered. The applicant will return at a later date to discuss the monument sign.

Mr. Knaak responded to Board questions on the indication on the Plan of the enhanced buffer; it is detailed in words but not by illustration.

Board Member Questions or Comments: A question was asked regarding an exit on the south side; a comment was made on the large amount and look of the paved parking and possible grass parking was discussed; a question was asked on the carry-over of the materials palette.

Public Comment: None.

Motion: Move to approve the Development Order with the stipulation that a pedestrian access be added to the south.

Motion by:	Board Member Anderson
Seconded by:	Board Member Glass

Action: Approved the Development Order with the stipulation that a pedestrian access be added to the south.

Vote: Aye: Unanimous Nay: Abstentions:

(3) Estero United Methodist Church (DOS2016-E005) (District 4) 8188 Lords Way Street, south of Broadway and east of US 41. The Village Council approved an amendment to the Estero United Methodist Church Community Facilities Planned Development Zoning with deviations to allow for the reconfiguration of the Master Concept Plan on January 18, 2017. Request to approve the Development Order including landscape buffers, monument sign, and site amenities. A Public Information Meeting was held before the Design Review Board on September 28, 2016.

Chairman McHarris returned to his position at the dais. No ex parte communications or conflicts of interest were noted.

Development Review Manager McCarthy provided a brief introduction. Staff is recommending that the Board approve the Development Order.

Presentation/Information by:

John Wojdak, DeLisi Fitzgerald, provided illustrations and details of the project: this Development Order is for the addition to the sanctuary building; only the extra parking necessary for this addition will be done at this time. The comments from the Design Review Board workshop have been incorporated.

Dalas Disney, Disney Architects, addressed the architecture: no floor plans have changed; simulated stucco has been taken off to tie in to the existing building; there are no landscape screens.

Greg Diserio, David M. Jones and Associates, spoke to the landscaping: some heritage trees need to be removed; the buffer along US 41 complies with all codes and zoning conditions; the existing sign is to be renovated to comply with Estero code; two public seating areas will be provided; some palms have been added and some plantings clustered; he provided extensive details on the number and types of trees proposed.

Board Member Questions or Comments: Questions were asked regarding what parking is not going in yet; tree types and numbers to be removed, replaced and/or planted; wall or screen effect of coco palms, the height of the berm and the need for the addition of coco palms to it. There was discussion on the possibility of relocating the existing

LeeTran bus stop to a shaded area, the cost and process of doing so and Lee County's potential interest in assuming that; Community Development Director Gibbs explained that Development Review Manager McCarthy had sent Lee County the project plans and received no response; a board member asked the applicant to speak with the County about this in person.

Public Comment:

Clark Mackenzie, Highland Avenue Marlene Rodak, Florida Native Plant Society

Summary of public comment: it would be nice if people leaving the church could exit directly onto US 41 instead of using Highlands Avenue; black olive trees and other shrubs mentioned are either not native plants or invasive according to Florida's Institute of Food and Agricultural Sciences and should be used with caution or not at all.

Motion: Move to approve the Development Order with the stipulations that the applicant communicate with LeeTran regarding the possible relocation of the bus stop and substitute the foxglove with another plant.

Motion by:Board Member JonesSeconded by:Board Member Prysi

Action: Approved the Development Order with the conditions that the applicant communicate with LeeTran regarding the possible relocation of the bus stop and substitute the foxglove with another plant.

Vote:

Aye: Unanimous

Nay:

Abstentions:

(4) Highland Oaks Drive at University Highlands (Minor Changes) (District 5) Located north of Miromar Outlet Drive and west of Ben Hill Griffin Road Minor changes to the landscaping and buffers approved for University Highlands; DOS2016-E008, DOS2016-E009 and DOS2016-E010. The Design Review Board approved on January 10, 2017 the Development Orders for Parcels 6, 7, and 10 with the condition that they return for further review for enhanced landscaping. Requesting approval of Minor Changes to the Development Orders for Parcels 6, 7 and 10.

Board Member O'Donnell disclosed several email exchanges regarding tree layouts and shrub hedging along Highland Oaks Drive; Chairman McHarris and Board Member Prysi disclosed the same communications. No other ex parte communications or conflicts of interest were noted.

Development Review Manager McCarthy provided a brief introduction.

Presentation/Information by:

David Hurst and Steve Sammons, Peninsula Engineering. Landscaping elements for Parcel 10 maintained or revised include: irrigation of the entire parcel; sod on all four sides up to the buffer widths and seed on the interior; Type A buffer along Miromar Outlets Boulevard; third seating area with plantings along Ben Hill Griffin corridor, with a minimum of 30% of required trees added within that buffer, clustered around seating areas; other corridor trees clustered with gaps at most logical future entry points; 10% of these trees are relocated to Everglades Parkway south. For Parcel 7: two seating areas and similar sod/seating and full irrigation; 30% of trees added with 2 palms added at ends for balance; Shady Lady trees left in place; buffer loosened along Tiburon Way with 10% of trees relocated. For Parcel 6: one seating area; same sod, seed and irrigation plans; planting similar to Parcel 7; 30% of required trees added along Ben Hill Griffin Parkway; gaps left for two tracts to parcel; flowering trees are above counts, as are the palms; no final decision has been made yet on coco palms.

Board Member Questions or Comments: A question was asked on the maintenance commitment for the seating areas. A comment was made that the plan is conceptually consistent with prior discussions, but that more than just a conceptual plan had been expected for a public hearing approval; the applicant referred the Board to the documents provided for further details on specific species, names, numbers and sizes and the Board then agreed that sufficient information was available for their decision.

Public Comment:

Peter Dersley, Grandezza JJ Basso, Grandezza Jim Shields, Grandezza Marlene Rodak, Florida Native Plant Society Neal VanDuyn, Grandezza

Summary of public comment: The Board was thanked for asking the applicant to return tonight with further plans; the new landscaping along Tidewater is a good example to follow; the landscaping at The Springs of Estero is not up to Estero standards and should be a Board concern; the Board and the developer were thanked for their work on the traffic light and the landscaping issue along Ben Hill Griffin, indicating care about the community; a brief PowerPoint presentation on area perimeter buffers was shown for examples of what to replicate and what to avoid in keeping with Estero standards; native buffer planting should not wait for later development, as even perimeters that are not well maintained in the interim or modified later are better than none; diverse, native plant perimeters are productive for wildlife and connecting corridors to other productive parcels; upper units in part of Grandezza currently have views of a only bare "battle ground" and I-75.

Board Member Questions or Comments: In response to public comment: a board member agreed with Ms. Rodak regarding perimeters and stated that this is a test case; Community Development Director Gibbs explained prior discussions on clear-cutting and other issues considered; the applicant explained that they are working with The Springs of Estero on that buffer and will be presenting a proposal to the Village soon for

Phase I landscaping by June. Verification was requested and received on storm water elevations.

Motion: Move to approve minor changes to the Development Orders for Parcels 6, 7 and 10.

Motion by:Board Member PrysiSeconded by:Board Member Anderson

Action: Approved minor changes to the Development Orders for Parcels 6, 7 and 10. Vote: Aye: Unanimous Nay: Abstentions:

6. PUBLIC INPUT: None.

7. BOARD COMMUNICATIONS:

- (a) **Committee Reports:** None.
- (b) Chairman's Reports: None.
- (c) Member Reports and Comments: None.

A motion to adjourn was made and duly passed.

8. ADJOURNMENT: 7:35 p.m.

Kathy Hall, MMC

Kathy Hall, MM Village Clerk

(kh/ta)